

DELEGATED FILE NOTE

CASE OFFICER: ...Mark Simmons.....

APPLICATION REFERENCE	BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT	APPLICATION SITE
24/01558/LBC	Replace 4no. first-floor windows (FW3 to FW6) with hardwood framed single-glazed windows including replacing Crittal-type casements with timber. Replace 6no. first-floor windows (FW9, FW11 to FW15) with softwood framed single-glazed windows. Replace 2no attic windows on SW gable with hardwood framed single-glazed windows re-using existing metal lattice work (as amended by drawing nos. S1041-PL12.P2; -PL13.P3; - PL14.P2; - PL15.P2 and - PL16.P2 and as amplified by drawing nos. S1041-PL20.P2; - PL21.P2 and -PL22.P1 received on 14.10.2024).	Town House Church End Barley Hertfordshire SG8 8JW

Submitted Plan Nos

Location Plan S1041-PL12.P2 S1041-PL13.P3 S1041-PL20.P2 S1041-PL14.P2 S1041-PL15.P2 S1041-PL16.P2 S1041-PL21.P2 S1014-PL22.P1

1.0 Policies

HE1 Designated heritage assets

SECN16 Conserve + enhance historic environment

2.0 Site History

2.1 Relevant planning history (see file for full history)

92/00375/1 - 2 storey and single storey rear extension.
CP 28.05.1992

92/00376/1LB - 2 storey and single storey rear extensions and internal alterations including partial removal of rear wall (in accordance with amended drawings received by Local planning authority on 1st May 1992)
CCON 30.06.1992

96/01439/1LB - Installation of first floor window in west elevation and internal alteration. Modification of frames of two first floor casement windows on front elevation, installation of two opening light casement windows in rear elevation to replace existing windows (as amended by drawings received on the 12th February 1997).
CON 07.04.1997

3.0 Policies

3.1 Policy HE1 of the North Hertfordshire Local Plan 2011 – 2031 is relevant as are the following paragraphs of Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework:

- ☐ 200 (local planning authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting)
- ☐ 203 (desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness),
- ☐ 205 (great weight should be given to the asset's conservation),
- ☐ 206 (clear and convincing justification), and
- ☐ 208 (harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use).

4.0 **Representations**

4.1 **Barley Parish Council – No comments received.**

Historic England – No objection (see below)

14 August 2024 (extract)

The proposed works would replace 10 windows on the first floor of the building to match the present timber framed construction and with single glazing. This is something we would support in principle but the date and historic significance of the windows which would be affected is not clear from the application documents. The Heritage Statement accompanying the application includes the listing description, which notes that the dormer windows and other parts of the building were added in the 19th or early 20th centuries. While they are not without historic interest this is perhaps of a lower order than any earlier or original windows and if their condition is poor, as stated by the applicant, a like-for-like replacement might not be contentious. Of other windows the information is less clear. In particular, the age of windows FW3, FW5 and FW10-15 and RW 1 and RW2 is not established. Before considering the condition it would be useful to know the age of these windows and of any elements they contain.

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) states that the purpose of the planning system is to achieve sustainable development and that protection and enhancement of the historic environment is an overarching objective in this (paragraphs 7 and 8). The significance of listed buildings can be harmed or lost by alteration to them. The NPPF states that clear and convincing justification should be made for any such harm and that 'great weight' should be given to the conservation of listed buildings irrespective of the level of harm caused (paragraphs 205 and 206). This weight given to conservation and the justification for harm should be especially convincing where harm to buildings of a high grade of listing is concerned, as is the case here.

We have considered this application in terms of this policy and are concerned that it is difficult to establish the potential impact on the significance of the listed building in terms of the NPPF, paragraphs 205 and 206 as the age of some of the windows is uncertain. Paragraph 200 of the NPPF requires applicants to describe the significance of heritage assets affected by proposed development. Sufficient information should also be provided to enable an understanding of the potential impact of the development on the asset. In this case we consider further details are needed on the windows to allow full assessment and satisfy the requirements of paragraph 200. We would not support the granting of consent at this time but would like to advise the Council further once further information has been secured.

Recommendation

Historic England has concerns regarding the application on heritage grounds, particularly as concerns the lack of information supplied with the application. We consider that the application does not meet the requirements of the NPPF, in particular paragraph numbers 7, 8, 200, 205 and 206. As the application stands we would not support the granting of consent, but recommend the Council secure additional information to satisfy paragraph 194 as described above. Following this we would be happy to advise the Council further.

27 August 2024 (extract)

Thank you for confirming details on RW1, RW2 and FW10-FW15. I have no objection to their replacement. As regards windows FW3 and FW5 the timber window frames may be part of the mid-19th century phase, although the mullions in FW3 could even be later, perhaps 20th century so their replacement would also be acceptable, but I would note that the window catches are of

some design interest and are clearly earlier, so retaining them in any replacement window would be desirable.

To conclude advice on the current application I can confirm that I would not oppose replacement of the critical windows or to the revised description of works as you suggest ('Replace 10no. first-floor windows (all elevations) with softwood framed single-glazed windows including replacing Critical-type casements with timber for FW3, FW4, FW5 and FW6.').

Press & site notices – No comments received.

5.0 **Planning Considerations**

5.1 **Site & Surroundings**

5.1.1 As described by Historic England:

The Town House is a good example of a late-period guildhall dating from the early 16th century which for most of its history has hosted a variety of community functions including the village school and is at present the village hall. It is of timber-framed construction with an impressive jettied front elevation intended to display the wealth of the community and status of the building. It has also seen considerable change since its construction including major phases of development in the 1850s and around 1910. The building is of exceptional historic and architectural interest as denoted by its grade II listing.*

The list entry is given below and both the building and the area are designated heritage assets for the purpose of applying the aims of Section 16 of the NPPF.

Formerly the Guildhall or Church House, used as a marriage feast room, free school, almshouses and for other public purposes; now a village hall. Early C16, altered c.1853 and c.1910. Built by the Gild of St. Catherine. Timber frame on brick base. Plastered. Steeply pitched tiled roof. 4 bays, that to left larger. 2 storeys. Continuous jetty to front with curved brackets to main bearers. Ground floor: 3 mid C19 entrances with plank and muntin doors, 4 centred arched heads, architraves, 4 two light lattice casements. First floor: 2 mid C19 8 light mullion and transom hipped half dormers, two 3 light casements. At each end of this elevation are enclosed external staircases, mid C19 to right, early C20 to left, with roofs swept down from main slope, 4 centred arched entrances with gabled heads. Inner returns have subsidiary doors beneath stairs, upper quatrefoil lights on all return faces. Left gable end massive original stack, exposed red brick with multiple coped offsets, originally external, built out to front in early C20 with ground floor flint and brick cladding. To rear a short lean-to, exposed plate and purlin. A similar stack at right end has been incorporated into Kirk Cottage (q.v.), exposed plate and purlin to front. To rear lattice casements and a late C19 2 storey gabled wing with an open ground floor, extruded red brick stack, 2 storey flat roofed addition. Interior: ground floor exposed framing of large scantling, close studding, jowled posts. Through passage to left of centre. Trimmer joist for original stairs. Original shutter grooves and mullion seatings. Axial and cross "axial chamfered bearers with carved foliate stops. Run out stop chamfered bearer in left bay. Upper chamber: jowled posts, some arched braces to chamfered cambered tie beams, collars to halved principals clasping purlins. Curved windbraces, ogee to front slope only. Continuous public use confirmed in inquests of 1609 and 1638.(RCHM 1910: VCH 1914: J. Wilkerson, Two Ears of Barley, 1969: S.E. Rigold, The Town House, Barley: Hertfordshire Archaeology, vol.3, 1973, p.94: Pevsner 1977: J. Wilkerson, Barley: An English Village, 1979: RCHM Typescript).

5.2 Proposal

- 5.2.1 The proposal is '**Replace 4no. first-floor windows (FW3 to FW6) with hardwood framed single-glazed windows including replacing Crittal-type casements with timber. Replace 6no. first-floor windows (FW9, FW11 to FW15) with softwood framed single-glazed windows. Replace 2no attic windows on SW gable with hardwood framed single-glazed windows re-using existing metal lattice work (as amended by drawing nos. S1041-PL12.P2; -PL13.P3; - PL14.P2; - PL15.P2 and - PL16.P2 and as amplified by drawing nos. S1041-PL20.P2; - PL21.P2 and -PL22.P1 received on 14.10.2024).**'

5.3 Key Issues

- 5.3.1 The key issue here is to consider the impact of this proposal on the special character of this grade II* listed building and upon the character or appearance of the Barley Conservation Area. With reference to Section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, the following should be noted: *"In considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special interest or historic interest which it possesses"*.
- 5.3.2 On 20 August, the case officer met with the agent on site and the following window summary was prepared by the case officer and forwarded to Historic England:

- ☐ **GW1-GW10** - Not affected by proposal.
- ☐ **FW1 and FW2** – Quatrefoil windows forming part of what is assumed to be the c.1853 works. The windows are not conventionally glazed but rather have a plain sheet of glass placed on the back face of the frame. Not considered to be in particularly poor condition and should be retained.
- ☐ **FW3 and FW5** – Triple light windows with Crittal-type casements and Crittal-type glazing bars to fixed lights. Assumed to be part of the c.1853 work but with casements maybe modified later(?)
- ☐ **FW4 and FW6** – Mid C19 8-light mullion-and-transom hipped dormers assumed to be part of c.1853 work. Combination of timber glazing bars and Crittal-type openable casements. Interestingly, the lower sections of both windows have had splice repairs undertaken to all mullions, stiles and bottom rails.
- ☐ **FW7 and FW8** – Quatrefoil windows forming part of what is assumed to be the c.1910 works. The windows are not conventionally glazed but rather have a plain sheet of glass placed on the back face of the frame and are copies of FW1 and FW2. Not considered to be in poor condition and should be retained.
- ☐ **FW9** – Pair of C20 casements of no special interest and replacement considered unobjectionable.
- ☐ **FW10** – Relatively modern C20 window of no special interest but not forming part of proposal.

- **FW11, FW12 and FW13** – *Relatively modern windows within late C19 rear addition. Windows not considered as possessing special interest and replacement considered unobjectionable.*
- **FW14 and FW15** – *Relatively modern C20 windows of no special interest and obscure glazing to middle and lower panes. Replacement considered unobjectionable.*
- **RW1** – *Mid C19 metal lattice window modified to accommodate louvres for mechanical fan behind – seek refurbishment and retention.*
- **RW2** – *Mid C19 metal lattice window – seek refurbishment and retention.*

5.3.3 The agent confirmed that the preference would be to replace the Crittall-type windows with timber to which neither myself or Historic England raise an objection. Generally, it is considered that none of the window framing is in such a particularly poor condition that replacement is considered essential, but it is acknowledged that some repairs have been undertaken in the past and that further repairs to repaired part frame may be more problematic. The agent was informed that windows FW1 and FW2, FW7 and FW8, RW1 and RW2 should be retained and which would require a revised description and that detailed window sections are required. Amended and additional plans were received on 14 October 2024.

5.3.4 The only outstanding matter and agreed with the applicant is to condition further details of windows FW9, FW11, FW12, FW13, FW14 & FW15 which will be provided prior to these being replaced (including the ironmongery associated with them).

5.4 **Alternative Options**

5.4.1 None applicable.

5.5 **Pre-Commencement Conditions**

5.5.1 None applicable.

5.6 **Conclusion**

5.6.1 It is considered that the replacement windows will: i) preserve the listed building's special character and ii) preserve the appearance of the Barley Conservation Area.

5.6.2 The proposed windows would satisfy the provisions of Sections 16(2) and 72(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, the aims of Section 16 of the NPPF and the aims of Policy HE1 of the North Hertfordshire Local Plan 2011-2031.

6.0 **Recommendation**

6.1 That Listed Building Consent be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

1. The work to which this consent relates shall be begun by not later than the expiration of the period of 3 years from the date of this notice.

Reason: To comply with the provisions of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. Window joinery section drawings (including glazing bar profile and glazing system) at a metric scale together with ironmongery details for windows FW9, FW11, FW12, FW13, FW14 & FW15 shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the manufacture of the windows. Thereafter, the windows shall be installed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the grade II* listed building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and Policy HE1 of the Local Plan.

Signed  Anne McDonald	Development Management North Hertfordshire District Council Council Offices Gernon Road Letchworth Herts SG6 3JF
Determining Officer Date: 15 October 2024	